

Embedding iCOASST Into Practice: Model Evaluations

Model name	Liverpool Bay Pilot Site Composition
Evaluation date	November 2016 (Note: attempts to run the composition were NOT successful)
Version of model and operating system used	Windows operating system using a 64bit version of FluidEarth. The ASMITA and Unalinea versions are as described on the model hompages.
Model filename	Liverpoolbay64.exe
Manual filename and date	Short explanation Liverpool Bay Composition.doc and Requirements Specification for Liverpool Bay Composition.doc
Version of windows used for the evaluation	Windows 7 Enterprise Version, 64 bit (Note: the composition could not be run using this operating system and configuration)

Scorings

0: No/ Not met / Unsatisfactory / Inappropriate

0.5: Partially met / appropriate in some aspects

1: Yes / met / Satisfactory / Appropriate



Evaluation not relevant for the user type

MODEL NAME: Liverpool Bay Pilot Site Composition

	Evaluation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
A. WEBSITE MODEL INTRODUCTION http://www.channelcoast.org/iCOASST/introduction/	1. Is the model description on the website adequate to understand what the model is for?	1	1	1	Yes the website provides a good description of the model composition along with the component models. It would be useful to have detail about the model inputs.
	2. Are relevant applications of the model explained?	1	1	1	Provides detail on what the composition is used for.
	3. Are the key model assumptions and limits to the model use explained?	0.5	0.5	0	The assumptions and limitations are not included and nor is any calibration information. The model assumptions and limitations should be covered under each model heading on the CCO website.
	4. Is the level of expertise required to use the model and/or use the results specified?	0	0	0	No.

MODEL NAME: Liverpool Bay Pilot Site Composition

	Evaluation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
B MODEL DOWNLOAD http://www.channelcoast.org/iCOASST/introduction/	1. Can you download the source code and/or executable/dll?		1	1	Yes an example of a single composition run can be downloaded (including executables, fluidearth files and inputs).
	2. Are there simple instructions to install, with images if needed?	1	1	1	There is an accompanying document with instructions and relevant images.
	4. Are the model boundary conditions explained?	N/A	N/A	N/A	These should be included within each models user manual.

MODEL NAME: Liverpool Bay Pilot Site Composition

	E valuation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
C. MODEL USER MANUAL	1. Is the user manual easy to read , user friendly and comprehensive?	N/A	N/A	N/A	There is no user manual.
	2. Is there sufficient information provided on what the model is doing and how it works?	N/A	N/A	N/A	
D. MODEL INPUTS	1. Is example model input data available to download and enough information provided to understand what they data represents?		1	1	Yes example model input data is available to download. There is information regarding input description and the scenarios run in a supporting document downloaded from the CCO.

MODEL NAME: Liverpool Bay Pilot Site Composition

E valuation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
	For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
2. Are all input parameters expanded / explained? Are ranges of values to be used indicated? Are required units provided?		1	1	There is information regarding input description and the scenarios run in a supporting document downloaded from the CCO.
3. Are timescales and date stamp inputs explained?	0.5	0.5	1	The accompanying document tells the user where to find this.
4. Are there any errors when you enter the compiled example data/input parameters?		0	0	Yes error messages were produced. It is not clear what the error message means.

MODEL NAME: Liverpool Bay Pilot Site Composition

	Evaluation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
E: MODEL RUNS	1. Does the model run successfully with the data provided?		0	0	No. The model developer was contacted and it was advised that a considerable amount of time would be needed to figure out the problem and then to solve it.
	2. Is information provided in the Manual on the operation system required and pre-requisites in terms of software?		N/A	N/A	There is no user manual and pre-requisites are not given.
	3. Is model calibration/validation discussed in the Manual?	N/A	N/A	N/A	
	4. Have you been able to successfully run another example that is different to the one provided?		0	0	No.
	5. Are potential errors and bugs dealt with in the manual?		N/A	N/A	No user manual.

MODEL NAME: Liverpool Bay Pilot Site Composition

	Evaluation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
F. MODEL OUTPUTS	1. Are the output file headings explained in the Manual?	1	1	1	These are fully described in a document downloaded from the CCO.
	2. Is the meaning of each of the output variables explained in the Manual?	1	1	1	These are fully described in a document downloaded from the CCO.
	3. Is there a description of how to process (tabulate and display) the output data?		1	1	This is shown with plots in a supporting document downloaded from the CCO.
G. OTHER	1. Does the Manual make further recommendations for reading and supply references?	1	1	1	These can be found on the CCO website.
	2. Is the Contact information completed?	1	1	1	Yes.
	3. Is the email address valid ?	1	1	1	Yes



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

Embedding iCOASST Into Practice: Model Evaluations

Recommendations table for model developer

Recommendation by HRW	Action responses
The composition should be re-configured so that it can be run on current operating systems	
The CCO website should include a statement that the composition cannot be re-run with the supplied inputs.	
A manual for the composition would be valuable.	