


Model name	Suffolk Pilot Site Composition
Evaluation date	January 2017 (Note: attempts to run the composition were NOT successful)
Version of model and operating system used	Windows PC used with FluidEarth2_Pipistrelle 2.2.3.0 x86. Composition requires full version of FluidEarth2_Pipistrelle 2.2.3.0 x86.
Model filename	DebenComposition_20_Comp_160516c.zip
Manual filename and date	Readme text file within model zip file (May 16)
Version of windows used for the evaluation	Windows 7 Enterprise Version, 64 bit (Note: the composition could not be run using this operating system and configuration)

Scorings

0: No/ Not met / Unsatisfactory / Inappropriate

0.5: Partially met / appropriate in some aspects

1: Yes / met / Satisfactory / Appropriate

 Evaluation not relevant for the user type

MODEL NAME: Suffolk Pilot Site Composition

	E valuation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
A. WEBSITE MODEL INTRODUCTION http://www.channelcoast.org/iCOASST/introduction/	1. Is the model description on the website adequate to understand what the model is for?	1	1	1	Good description of the composition and its component models, including the inputs and calibration. Also, includes detail of the case study composition run.
	2. Are relevant applications of the model explained?	1	1	1	Provides detail on what the composition is used for.
	3. Are the key model assumptions and limits to the model use explained?	1	1	0.5	Not highly necessary for a composition but the composition calibration limits have been touched on. The model assumptions and limitations should be covered under each model heading on the CCO website.
	4. Is the level of expertise required to use the model and/or use the results specified?	0	0	0	No.

MODEL NAME: Suffolk Pilot Site Composition

	Evaluation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
B MODEL DOWNLOAD http://www.channelcoast.org/iCOASST/introduction/	1. Can you download the source code and/or executable/dll?		1	1	Yes an example of a single composition run can be downloaded (including executables, fluidearth files, inputs and outputs).
	2. Are there simple instructions to install, with images if needed?	1	1	1	There is a readme file with simple instructions to run the composition. There are no images to go with the instructions.
	4. Are the model boundary conditions explained?	N/A	N/A	N/A	These should be included within each models user manual.

MODEL NAME: Suffolk Pilot Site Composition

	E valuation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
C. MODEL USER MANUAL	1. Is the user manual easy to read , user friendly and comprehensive?	N/A	N/A	N/A	There is no user manual for this but there is a readme text file.
	2. Is there sufficient information provided on what the model is doing and how it works?	N/A	N/A	N/A	Readme text file
D. MODEL INPUTS	1. Is example model input data available to download and enough information provided to understand what they data represents?		0.5	0.5	Yes there is both a single composition run to download as well as all 28 composition scenarios. There is enough information to understand what each scenarios represent. There is no information regarding input description. This can be found, however, within the user manual of the model itself.
	2. Are all input parameters expanded / explained? Are ranges of values to be used indicated? Are required units provided?		0.5	0.5	No. This can be found, however, within the user manual of the model itself.

MODEL NAME: Suffolk Pilot Site Composition

	E valuation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
	3. Are timescales and date stamp inputs explained?	0.5	0.5	0.5	The composition run timescale is included in the readme file for the example single composition run but not for each scenario.
	4. Are there any errors when you enter the compiled example data/input parameters?		0	0	Yes. The example single composition would not run. The .chi file was then run within fluid earth which did not successfully complete either and produced errors. These errors could not be fixed.
E. MODEL RUNS	1. Does the model run successfully with the data provided?		0	0	No, the composition does not run. The composition can be rebuilt using the MESO_i user manual: appendix C. However, this did not fix the errors. The model developer was contacted and it was advised that a considerable amount of time would be needed to figure out the problem.
	2. Is information provided in the Manual on the operation system required and pre-requisites in terms of software?		N/A	N/A	There is no user manual and pre-requisites are not given.

MODEL NAME: Suffolk Pilot Site Composition

	E valuation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
	3. Is model calibration/validation discussed in the Manual?	N/A	N/A	N/A	
	4. Have you been able to successfully run another example that is different to the one provided?		0	0	No, none of the other composition scenarios could be run.
	5. Are potential errors and bugs dealt with in the manual?		N/A	N/A	No user manual.
F. MODEL OUTPUTS	1. Are the output file headings explained in the Manual?	0	0	0.5	The outputs for each model are not listed or explained on the CCO website within the Suffolk composition section, only the inputs.
	2. Is the meaning of each of the output variables explained in the Manual?	0	0	0.5	The outputs for each model are not listed or explained on the CCO website within the Suffolk composition section, only the inputs. A list of the outputs can be found within each model user manual.

MODEL NAME: Suffolk Pilot Site Composition

	E valuation Question	Score (0 / 0.5 / 1)			Comment
		For User Type 1: End User (Coastal Manager)	For User Type 2: Basic modeller (simple input changes only)	For User Type 3: Advanced modeller / model coder (application to entirely new systems / model development)	
	3. Is there a description of how to process (tabulate and display) the output data?		0	0	No there is no information regarding how best to represent and tabulate the data.
G. OTHER	1. Does the Manual make further recommendations for reading and supply references?	1	1	1	The references are included on the CCO website.
	2. Is the Contact information completed?	0	0	0	No contact information.
	3. Is the email address valid ?	0	0	0	No email address to contact.

Recommendations table for model developer

Recommendation by HRW	Action response
The composition should be re-configured so that it can be run on current operating systems	
Suggest include output list and definitions on the CCO website or text to direct user to each model user manual.	
The CCO website should include a statement that the composition cannot be re-run with the supplied inputs.	
It would be helpful to have a reference to the MESO_i user manual appendix C to enable a user/developer to build their own composition.	
Supply contact details.	
A manual for the composition would be valuable.	